

**From:** D'Anna, Lori - (ldanna) ldanna@arizona.edu  
**Subject:** FW: MA in Philosophy & Political Economy  
**Date:** January 25, 2021 at 3:37 PM  
**To:** Hammer, Ronald P - (rhammer) rhammer@arizona.edu



Hi Ron,

Is this what you're looking for?

Best,  
Lori

-----Original Message-----

From: Hammer, Ronald P - (rhammer) <rhammer@arizona.edu>  
Sent: Wednesday, December 2, 2020 2:59 PM  
To: Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1) <martind1@arizona.edu>  
Cc: Tarko, Vlad - (vladtarko) <vladtarko@email.arizona.edu>; D'Anna, Lori - (ldanna) <ldanna@arizona.edu>; Carnie, Andrew H - (carnie) <carnie@arizona.edu>; Pitts, Margaret J - (mjpitts) <mjpitts@arizona.edu>; Sandoval, Liz - (esandmar) <esandmar@arizona.edu>  
Subject: Re: MA in Philosophy & Political Economy

Yes, that's fine Martin. Liz will accept your earlier message as a withdrawal of the objection. Glad this worked out.

Ron

On Dec 2, 2020, at 2:52 PM, Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1) <martind1@arizona.edu> wrote:

Sure..., but note that they were cc'd!  
Is this good enough, everyone?  
M

-----Original Message-----

From: Hammer, Ronald P - (rhammer) <rhammer@arizona.edu>  
Sent: Wednesday, December 02, 2020 2:51 PM  
To: Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1) <martind1@arizona.edu>  
Cc: Tarko, Vlad - (vladtarko) <vladtarko@email.arizona.edu>; D'Anna, Lori - (ldanna) <ldanna@arizona.edu>; Carnie, Andrew H - (carnie) <carnie@arizona.edu>; Pitts, Margaret J - (mjpitts) <mjpitts@arizona.edu>; Sandoval, Liz - (esandmar) <esandmar@arizona.edu>  
Subject: Re: MA in Philosophy & Political Economy

Sure, that is fine Martin. Would you mind sending a email message to Liz Sandoval in Academic Administration (cc to Lori and Andrew) stating that you understand that the purpose of the proposed PEMS economics course differs from that of courses in your department and that you withdraw your objection. I think this will provide the necessary program support. Thanks.

Ron

On Dec 2, 2020, at 2:44 PM, Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1) <martind1@arizona.edu> wrote:

Hi everyone,

Can we do this by email? Vlad and I had a nice collegial meeting yesterday where we had an interesting and helpful discussion that I believed increased our understanding of each other's programs.

My original concern had to do with a worry that PEMS' program would offer to teach "economics," and in particular the subfields of econometrics, game theory, experimental economics, and behavioral economics. However, as Vlad explained to me, the purposes of their program are indeed different. While PEMS' courses may eclectically use some methods that come from the areas I mentioned, the goal is always to teach students about political philosophy and legal science. I can accept this explanation and therefore remove my objections to starting the program.

All the best,  
Martin Dufwenberg

Martin Dufwenberg  
Head, Economics

-----Original Message-----

From: Hammer, Ronald P - (rhammer) <rhammer@arizona.edu>  
Sent: Wednesday, December 02, 2020 2:31 PM  
To: Tarko, Vlad - (vladtarko) <vladtarko@email.arizona.edu>  
Cc: Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1) <martind1@arizona.edu>; D'Anna, Lori - (ldanna) <ldanna@arizona.edu>; Carnie, Andrew H - (carnie) <carnie@arizona.edu>; Pitts, Margaret J - (mjpitts) <mjpitts@arizona.edu>; Sandoval, Liz - (esandmar) <esandmar@arizona.edu>  
Subject: Re: MA in Philosophy & Political Economy

Sorry for the delay in my response, Vlad. The best outcome would be to see whether Peter and Martin can resolve the issue through future discussion resulting in a letter of support for your proposal from the Department of Economics. Your explanation seems quite reasonable.

We look forward to seeing you on December 18.

Ron

On Nov 23, 2020, at 8:37 PM, Tarko, Vlad - (vladtarko) <vladtarko@email.arizona.edu> wrote:

Dear Ron,

Thank you for your message!

The Dec. 18 meeting would work. I will further contact Lori to set up the exact details.

Should I write a formal response to the question about overlap with economics courses to be appended to the application, or should I just address this in the presentation? In a nutshell, the overlap is far smaller than it seems at first glance. The classes are using similar tools, but for very different purposes. The PPE classes use those tools primarily to discuss philosophical questions about theories of justice. Martin Dufwenbert had an informal meeting with Peter Vanderschraaf, but we should probably talk some more!

Cheers,  
Vlad

--

Vlad Tarko  
University of Arizona  
Head, Department of Political Economy and Moral Science  
Social Science Building 111B  
<http://vladtarko.com>  
<https://moralscience.arizona.edu/>

---

From: Hammer, Ronald P - (rhammer) <rhammer@arizona.edu>  
Sent: Monday, November 23, 2020 12:06 PM  
To: Tarko, Vlad - (vladtarko)  
Cc: Dufwenberg, Martin - (martind1); D'Anna, Lori - (ldanna); Carnie, Andrew H - (carnie); Pitts, Margaret J - (mjpitts); Sandoval, Liz - (esandmar)  
Subject: MA in Philosophy & Political Economy

Dear Vlad,

I am contacting you to follow up on the discussion of your proposal for the new MA in Philosophy & Political Economy in the Graduate Council meeting last Friday. The proposal was reviewed and well received by the Graduate Program Executive Review Committee prior to the meeting and came to Council with limited time for member review. Our members raised two questions on the proposal which led to its deferral:

1. The issue of overlap with economics courses from the Department of Economics was not addressed in the proposal.

2. The Council would like someone from your department to attend our next meeting to provide a brief presentation on the new program and answer questions from members.

We often try to address any course conflicts that arise by requesting a letter of support from the collaborating department. Also, it is common to request a visit to Council from a program proposer to address any questions, so I apologize that this was not requested prior to the meeting.

Ideally, we would take up the program in the presence of someone from your department to explain the proposal and address questions when we meet in December or January. In the meantime, you might want to contact Martin Dufwenbert, Head of Economics, to discuss the course overlap issue. You may contact Lori D'Anna at the Graduate College to schedule the visit to Grad Council at an upcoming meeting shown below:

December Grad Council Meeting, Friday, Dec. 18, 3 – 5 p.m.  
January Grad Council Meeting, Friday, Jan. 15, 3 – 5 p.m.

Please feel free to contact me with any questions. Thank you in advance.

Ron

---

Ronald P. Hammer, Jr., PhD  
Professor of Basic Medical Sciences, Pharmacology,  
and Psychiatry  
Pronouns: him/he/his

Chair, UA Graduate Council  
Co-Director, Clinical Translational Sciences Graduate Program  
Co-Director, MD/PhD Program  
Director, Graduate Training Office  
The University of Arizona College of Medicine, Phoenix

Mail: 425 N. Fifth Street  
Phoenix, AZ 85004-2157  
Phone: 602-827-2112  
FAX: 602-827-2130  
Email: [Ron.Hammer@arizona.edu](mailto:Ron.Hammer@arizona.edu)  
Web: <http://phoenixmed.arizona.edu/directory/hammer-ronald>

