

**MINUTES  
FACULTY SENATE  
DECEMBER 11, 2023**

Once approved, these minutes may be accessed electronically at:

<http://arizona.openrepository.com/arizona/handle/10150/107812>

Visit the faculty governance webpage at:

<http://facultygovernance.arizona.edu/>

The recording of this meeting may be found at:

<https://arizona.hosted.panopto.com/Panopto/Pages/Viewer.aspx?id=1b13deb1-6730-42d7-82e7-b0d600003eec1>

**1. CALL TO ORDER [00:00:08]**

Presiding Officer of the Faculty Senate, Mona Hymel, called the December 11, 2023, Special Faculty Senate meeting to order at 3:03 PM via Zoom. Secretary Dysart was also present.

**Present:** Senators Braitberg, Braithwaite, Brochin, Cai, Casey, Cheu, Coletta, Cooley, Cui, Domin, Downing, Dysart (Secretary), Fellous, Fink, Gerald, Gordon, Gregory, Guzman, Harris, Hudson (Chair), Hymel (Vice Chair), Jones, Knox, Leafgren, Little, Marx, Meyer, Neumann, O' Leary, Pace, Pau, Rafelski, Rankin, Robbins (President), Rocha, Schulz, Schwartz, Senseney, Simmons, Slepian, M. Smith, J. Smith, Spece, Stegeman (Parliamentarian), Stephan, Stone, Su, Torres, Waddell, Werchan, Williams, Willis, Wittman, Zeiders, Ziurys.

**Absent:** Senators Bernick, Anderson (GPSC Rep), Barron (ASUA Rep), Cochran, Dial, Dyke-Compton, Eckert, Grijalva (ASUA Rep), Kandel, Medevoi, Nelson, Ottusch, Rodrigues, Rogers, Russell, Sanchez, Tropman, M. Witte, R. Witte, Yoon (GPSC Rep).

**2. ACTION ITEM: APPROVAL OF THE AGENDA – VICE CHAIR OF THE FACULTY, MONA HYMEL [00:00:45]**

Vice Chair Hymel stated speakers will be limited to two minutes. Vice Chair Hymel asked if there were guests who would like to speak about the Global MD proposal, to notify her. Vice Chair Hymel stated closed captioning is now enabled for Zoom participants.

- Chair Hudson moved [**Motion 2023/24-21**] to approve the agenda. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.
- Vice Chair Hymel stated if there are any technical issues on Zoom that are not being addressed, senators may unmute themselves to notify her.

**3. ACTION ITEM: CONSENT AGENDA: [00:03:11]**

**Proposal MS Computer Science and Engineering with ABOR Summary, Proposal Ph.D. Computer Science and Engineering with ABOR Summary, Proposal BS in Real Estate with ABOR Summary, Enrollment Policies and Benchmarking, Proposal Emancipatory Education Graduate Minor [00:03:47]**

Senator Fink moved [**Motion 2023/24-22**], [**Motion 2023/24-23**], [**Motion 2023/24-24**], [**Motion 2023/24-25**], and [**Motion 2023/25-26**] to approve the seconded motions of the Consent Agenda. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**4. NEW BUSINESS [00:04:06]**

**A. Information and Action Item: Global MD Proposal with Presentation - Associate Vice President for UAHS New Initiatives, Steve Goldschmid, Interim Dean, College of Health Sciences, Kevin C. Lohenry, Associate Vice President, Finance and Business Affairs, Health Sciences, David Elmer, Assistant Vice President, Indigenous Affairs, Carlos Gonzales, Dean, University of Western Australia Medical School, Brendan McQuillan, and Head of International Medical Education, University of Western Australia Medical School, Scotty McCoombe. [00:04:12]**

- Senator Schartz asked if there can be strict time limits set for both the presenter and speakers.
  - Vice Chair Hymel stated the total time limit for the item will be thirty minutes, but she does have jurisdiction to extend discussion by fifteen minutes.
  - Senator Schwartz stated he would prefer it if the discussion was not extended as senators have other items to work on.

**Steve Goldschmid, Associate Vice President for UAHS New Initiatives [00:06:03]**

Members of the audience and a few other speakers include:

- David Elmer, the AVP for Finance (AHSC)
- Carlos Gonzalez, the Assistant VP for Indigenous Affairs
- Kevin Loherty, the Interim Dean for the College of Health Sciences
- Two Australian colleagues including Brendan McQuillan, the Dean of the University of the Western Australia School of Medicine, and Scott McCoombe, the Deputy Dean of Education for Global MD.

Acknowledgement of Country will be completed for both Arizona and Australia. There were previous issues with this that can be addressed later in the meeting.

The program began four to five years ago where was a discussion with the President of the University of Arizona, the President of the University of Western Australia, donors, and Dr. Dake. The individuals thought it would be a reasonable idea for both universities to collaborate in medicine. Associate Vice President for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid was asked to take the project over approximately two years ago. There is now a vision, mission, and there is a hope to address the global primary care physician shortage and improve access to healthcare for the well-being of all people, particularly in Arizona.

The program will train and cultivate physicians, leaders, and innovators to meet the needs of the indigenous Native Americans, rural, and underserved communities globally. There is a hope to assist in creating environments that attract and retain primary care providers in underserved communities as this is part of the reason doctors leave the communities. Typically, these are viewed as unattractive environments but there is a hope for the program to serve as an example for transnational education.

There has been a severe shortage of physicians throughout the country, and throughout the world, where primary care stands out. Primary care has the worst shortage of all the specialties which was outlined and predicted by the American Association of Medical Colleges, the Australian Medical Association, and others.

The partnership was formalized in July 2021 and there is a hope to offer a medical degree that highlights Indigenous Health, Primary Care, and Global Health. The program would like to produce physicians who are going to be exposed to other countries' health care systems, particularly, healthcare in tribal nations.

The students will spend their preclinical years (first two years) at the University of Western Australia in Perth. Clinical years (last two years) will be spent in Arizona. During the student's fourth year, they will have to return to Australia for a six-week rotation on Indigenous lands. They will have immersion in rural, indigenous, low-income, and middle-income clinics and hospitals in their first two and last two years.

The program hopes to provide a partial solution to the shortages of healthcare providers and underserved rural and Indigenous areas. There is an aim to train physicians who will provide high quality, holistic, culturally safe, and competent care, spanning multiple disciplines.

The graduates will have a worldwide perspective as they will be traveling a lot, and it will continue to create new opportunities, partnerships, collaborations, and research. The curriculum is like any curriculum in North America but also includes differences. Differences include the fact that Native American and Indigenous peoples participate in the development of the Indigenous curriculum. Currently, the American Indian Higher Education Consortium (AIHEC) Board, Director of Health Disparities Outreach and Prevention Education for Center for Rural Health, Agnes Attakai, and Assistant VP for Indigenous Affairs, Carlos Gonzales are collaborating on the curriculum.

There will be an advisory board formed which will include more Indigenous leaders. Students will have hands-on, immersive field work, and will live in the communities when doing their rotations. There will be a longitudinal component of the curriculum that will focus on primary care, mental health, and the student's well-being. There is a goal for students to learn the true value of cultural competency when working with different lands, people, cultures, and decision-making authorities.

It is known that many are concerned about funding, especially with the current climate. There will be no money taken from anyone and the funding will come through the state appropriation for new economic initiatives and through UAHS reserves. When the program is up and running, the costs will total approximately \$14 million. Annual expenses are expected to total approximately \$7 million, with a profit of approximately \$5 million. The Assistant Vice President for Finance, David Elmer can go into more detail regarding finances.

When students are in Australia, tuition will be paid to the University of Western Australia, when students are in Arizona, tuition will be paid to the University of Arizona. 71% of the funds will be returned to the program, 14% is set aside by ABOR for student scholarships, and 15% will be returned to the University.

There are many benefits to the program, and there has been a lot of feedback and questions. This is a standalone

educational pathway housed in the new College of Health Sciences and is not a part of the UA Global Campus. The goal is to accept 25% or more of students from Native American, Indigenous, and minority backgrounds. It is expected that most students will attend from North America. The University of Queensland and Oschner Clinical School have a similar program, where students go to Australia for two years and return to the United States. Almost all of their students are from North America.

This will be a distinctive degree, from the University of Arizona Colleges of Medicine partly due to not being accredited by the Liaison Committee on Medical Education (LCME). The LCME will not accredit a college that sends students overseas. Students will be accredited by the Australian Medical Council. There is already accreditation by WSCUC.

There was a lot of concern that there would be clinical rotation sites stolen as this is difficult to secure for Colleges of Medicine. This program has already secured over 160 clinical rotations from various organizations throughout Arizona, in wiring. There will be partnerships with all the Health Sciences at the University of Arizona and there is already an agreement with the University of Arizona College of Medicine in Phoenix, the College of Nursing, and the College of Public Health.

Everyone including students, the University, and patients benefit from the program. Patients who are in these communities with limited access to care, and poor health outcomes can be positively impacted by the program. There is a hope that the primary care physician shortage in Arizona, throughout the U.S., and globally will be addressed.

- Senator M. Smith asked for clarification on whether the reserve funds come from the University of Arizona.  
[00:16:09]
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated the program put down new economic initiative, a legislative appropriation in reserve funds. A little over \$13 million was received in a state appropriation specific for new economic initiatives and workforce development. This has been the sole of funds that has been used to develop this program, the PA program, PT program, and midwifery program. There was a reserve amount put in because there are relatively stable reserves and there is an ability to backstop the money if needed.
- Senator Ziurys asked which four tribes are in support of the program.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated he grew up in Tucson and is a part of the Pascua Yaqui Tribe. The four tribes include the Pascua Yaqui, Tohono O'odham, Salt River Pima-Maricopa, and San Carlos Apache.
- Senator Braitberg asked to practice in the United States, will students have to complete a requirement by the Educational Commission for Foreign Medical Graduates (ECFMG). Senator Braitberg asked what kind of support will be provided for students to prepare them to successfully pass the ECFMG test as this will present another issue.
- Senator Braitberg stated the tuition is set at \$75,000 and it has been compared to other private universities, but it seems that it's much higher than what out-of-state students are paying at the University of Arizona Medical School. Senator Braitberg asked how it will be feasible and attractable for Native American students who come from communities that may struggle financially creating debt burden and other matters.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated as far as the ECFMG goes, this is a common process in the United States and takes very little additional effort for students to get through the test. The ECFMG has been contacted and they are willing to work with the program throughout the entire four-years to ensure students complete additional tasks to be eligible to go directly into practice. This includes United States Medical Licensing Examination (USMLE) which is included in the curriculum with additional preparation, time, and support for students. This will give students a greater chance to pass the USMLE on their first attempt. The ECFMG will monitor things as time goes on to ensure students are on track. Students will need to take an English proficiency exam and follow the ECFMG guidelines to obtain certification from the ECFMG to be eligible to apply for residency to then practice in the United States.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated as far as the \$75,000 tuition, all offshore schools including the Caribbean schools, Osteopathic schools, and many other private medical schools in the U.S. have similar tuition rates. In Arizona, the program will not begin until 2027 and by that time, many schools may be at the same tuition rate. At that point, there will be around \$2.1 million in scholarship funding, and there have been applications for grants. The program is working with Tribal communities that do have money available, and there are scholarships that students can likely receive. Leaders will work to ensure costs aren't outrageous to students that cannot afford to attend. There are payback programs in almost every rotation location where if a student returns, they will cover a large sum of their tuition debt.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated in terms of debt repayment, there is a primary care scholarship program which the legislature provides funding flexibility for. There is flexibility on how much money is applied, currently there is acceptance of ninety-four students across two medical schools who will then graduate and serve in primary care professions within the State of Arizona in underserved areas. Four programs that offer loan repayment include the National Health Service Corps, the Indian Health Services, the Veterans Affairs, and the State of Arizona. Students need to be funneled into programs to get access to these dollars which align with them with the goal of serving underserved populations.

- Senator Braitberg asked if there is specific consideration of offering a certain number to native students.
  - Vice Chair Hymel stated that Senators Dysart, Slepian, and Fink will ask their question prior to Senator Braitberg's question being answered.
- Secretary Dysart stated she is excited about this program as she is one of the only Native senators and serves on the Arizona Committee of the U.S. Commission on Civil Rights which has been looking at racial disparities in healthcare. The committee has noticed a tremendous need for doctors, especially on the reservations.
- Secretary Dysart asked Dr. Gonzales if he knows of students' feelings who grew up in tight-knit communities on reservations regarding being open to spending two years away from their communities, in Australia.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated the Tribes are very excited about supporting their students to go into the program and return to the communities.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated he has been running several Native American programs also at the College of Medicine of Tucson and he is aware of the anxiety and issues regarding coming from the reservations. There will be a lot of student support.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated himself and Executive Assistant, Claudia Duran will be present for the initial orientation in Australia providing connections with the aboriginal program in Western Australia. When students return, support will be reinitiated. Students will experience a unique program as they students will be required to spend six weeks in one of the Native American communities in Arizona. The curriculum will be designed with the help of Native communities to address common cultural and community issues that they feel are important to address. Students will be well prepared if they choose to return to their communities to address such issues.
- Senator Slepian stated he is enthusiastic for the program as there has been a lot of debate about this including back-and-forth email questions, there is a certain degree of incomplete information that many had. This is a great opportunity to vet issues. The opportunity to work with a solid university in Australia, with an English-speaking curriculum will be extremely similar and even more enriching as it shows world-wide medical exposures. Senator Slepian stated this is very valuable and wishes more students had global exposure due to certain happenings such as the COVID-19 pandemic. Medicine should be thought of in a more universal way, and a lot of people are not fully aware of the full picture.
- Senator Slepian moved **[Motion 2023/24-27]** to move forward with the Global MD Proposal.
  - Motion was seconded.
  - Senator Ziurys asked to continue discussion.
  - Vice Chair Hymel stated after the motion is made and seconded, she repeats it, and turns it back over to the maker of the motion where discussion can continue.
  - Senator Slepian stated his goal was not to end discussion but to simply state his support.
  - Senator Downing stated in the previous senate minutes, there was a resolution brought forward which he thought was the accepted motion relating to what was needed in Australia. Senator Downing asked if the resolution aligns with Senator Slepian's motion.
  - Senator Downing stated he would like to hear from the Dean.
  - Vice Chair Hymel asked if the motion was stated correctly.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated he believes the motion was stated correctly.
- Senator Fink stated if students obtain their training outside of the U.S., they cannot independent lay hands-on patients and there is an extra exam required. Senator Fink stated he also learned there is an extra residency required before being eligible to take the exam.
- Senator Fink asked if the extra students would be competing for in-state residency positions against the other four medical schools. Senator Fink stated a comment for Dr. Goldschmid is that he used the words, "we hope," in almost every sentence and asked if there is more tangible substantiation of such hopes.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated throughout the country there are a limited number of residency slots creating competition. With recognition of the extreme shortage, there is work being done to increase the number of residency slots throughout the country. It was learned that the Phoenix area alone will begin to add more slots. Over the next few years, there should be 229 additional slots, over 50% of which will be for primary care. There is partnership with Dr. Dan Derksen who is assisting with legislation and funding to increase the number of residents in the current primary care slots in Arizona, and to develop new slots. There has been some success in obtaining funding and there is a hope of continuing adding to those slots.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated students cannot be forced to stay within certain areas but if one is more familiar with an area, and completes their residency there, they are more likely to stay in that state. Over 50% of students who complete their residency in a particular state stay in that same state.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated there is no hindrance, once a student gets through ECFMG certification, there can be an application for residency which is the same process for all other students. Once a residency is completed, the student can begin to practice.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated he did not understand the second part of the question.
- Senator Fink stated it was for semantics, because during the presentation Dr. Goldschmid prefaced every sentence with "we hope," and it would have been encouraging if hopes were based on substantiated plans or data

and statistics.

- AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated is unsure of how to respond to the question but there has been collaboration with the University of Western Australia and there is a curriculum worked out for all four years. There is a document which includes the curriculum that was submitted to the governing body. There are over 160 cites verified by the Chief Medical Officer and Chief Executive Officer of each organization that will work with the program. The University of Western Australia has hired more faculty to teach the students over the first two years and have obtained significant teaching locations that will be used, as well as a promise of a new education building in the next couple of years. A lot has been accomplished over the initial years, and there is confidence in moving forward in a positive way.
- Senator Braitberg stated he directs the Health & Human Values Minor for the W.A. Franke Honors College which introduces students to the social science and humanities perspective on healing and medicine. Many of the students are passionate about working in underserved and marginalized communities. Senator Braitberg stated he believes this program would be of tremendous interest to his students. There are roughly one-hundred students who would be eager to apply to this program.
- Senator Braitberg stated regarding the interdisciplinary dimension of the program, he did not see a particular course or emphasis on integration of historical, sociological, anthropological, or other perspectives. The comparative nature of the experience, including the historical dimension of marginalization, dispossession, and appropriation of resources, which native communities have faced in both the U.S. and Australia. This sparks the question of how students will be provided with an intellectual framework they can make sense of for with the incredibly meaningful and powerful experiences they will have.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated the reasons local communities are being involved in both the U.S. and Australia is to help devise and develop a curriculum that will address all issues including historical trauma, generational trauma, displacement, and resource allocation which has deprived the native communities of their normal functions and ways of supporting themselves.
  - AVP for Indigenous Affairs, Dr. Gonzales stated all students will be exposed to this curriculum, not just Native students which will ensure everyone understands Native American populations have experiences and are experiencing in relation to health disparities. In normal medical schools, students spend a total of four hours on curriculum concerning Native American health issues.
- Secretary Ziurys stated she had the privilege of having one of the few Native American PhD students in the Physical Sciences who graduated, and she “can say it’s very difficult to get American Indians (I’ve been told it should be called American Indians), Native Americans off the reservation to integrated into normal society”. Senator Ziurys stated her student was not living on the reservation and was living in Tucson although, she was unable to persuade him to go anywhere other than Arizona to complete his post-doctoral fellowship. Senator Ziurys stated her student chose to stay in Arizona because family is extremely important.
  - Senator Ziurys stated it is difficult for Native Americans to leave the United States and go to Australia. This is an unrealistic expectation. Furthermore, if more Native Americans are wanted in medical school, they should be admitted into the Colleges of Medicine and not force them to travel to a foreign country to obtain their medical degree.
  - Senator Ziurys stated it is a bit degrading and is indicative to place different Tribes into this type of situation and lump them into one category of Native people. Senator Ziurys stated she has a friend in the American Indian Studies Program who is getting her PhD and has explained how different tribes have different traditions and histories even within the United States.
- Senator Downing stated he would like to thank Dr. Gonzales as he has conducted many blessing ceremonies, his wife recruited Native Americans for the medical school and rural health for a while and assisted with founding the Talking Medicine Circle. Senator Downing stated this is very personal to him as he also assisted with financing in the beginning.
  - Senator Downing stated not only is Dr. Gonzales’ understanding of Indigenous knowledge issues important, but so is his participation in putting his knowledge into the curriculum and being involved in student rotations.
  - Senator Downing stated one of his concerns regards Senator Fink’s comment about the model, which he understands has been developed and can provide the expected yield rate of 50% of students staying in Arizona. Senator Downing asked how many students will go into the residency and yield as primary care physicians in Arizona. Senator Downing stated this is a matter of modeling, and not a matter of “hope.”
  - Senator Downing stated if he was a student who had \$75,000 and discovered that the University of Western Australia is ranked number thirty-two in the world in clinical medicine, and the University of Arizona is ranked low, he would take a couple of years of science and try to get into the higher quality clinical medicine program. Senator Downing stated he is wondering whether the leakages of this model have been looked at.
- Senator Downing asked if there is enough commitment for the people involved to do this program even if it made no money.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated yes, this is part of the mission, and they would not care if they made money. It is believed that this will be a large benefit to the state. There was research conducted, and it is estimated that about 65% of the students will stay in Arizona. Therefore, over the

- next 10 to 15 years, there should be over 900 graduates within rural Arizona if the numbers align.
  - Senator Downing asked for clarification on if students staying as primary care physicians of rural areas is the objective.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated yes, rural areas are the objective although students can go wherever they wish. AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated he gave the statistics to show how many primary care positions will be landed somewhere and by 2030, it is expected that 900 graduates would be within rural Arizona.
  - Senator Downing stated he likes the commitment regardless of the cost.
- Senator Schwartz stated hearing all the positive assessments of the program, and having read the information that Senior Associate Vice President, Dr. Michael D. Dake sent out, he was less enamored of the idea and thought of it as a predatory attraction to students. This will cost \$75,000 per year and will result in a degree that is not recognized in the United States. Senator Schwartz stated he recognized that students can take an exam and become licensed in some fashion, but they will not have MDs.
  - Senator Schwartz stated students will be trained essentially in primary care, then be forced to take a career in a far less remunerative area than others in medicine, and it is terrifying. Senator Schwartz stated there is a chance students will be recruited because they were unable to get into medical students in the United States. Senator Schwartz stated he predicts many of the students will be upper, middle-class students whose parents can afford to help them with a half \$1 million of medical school and living expenses. Senator Schwartz stated this type of debt will be hard to pay back and it leaves him uncomfortable. Senator Schwartz stated if individuals who fell into a certain low-income category were allowed to participate in the program tuition-free, he would be more comfortable supporting this program. Senator Schwartz asked why these students cannot be admitted into existing and new medical schools in Arizona at UA, ASU, and NAU.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated all students will have MDs and there has been \$2.2 million in scholarships that has been identified, and more is expected. Students that cannot pay will be favored and Tribal leaders are aware of the facts and agree with the program moving forward. The admission criteria are no different than the admission criteria for the colleges of medicine that exist in Arizona. Of all foreign medical graduates that are U.S. born, there is a 70% match at quality programs throughout the United States, and many will come from programs comparable to this one.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated he understands where Senator Schwartz is coming from and thinks they can accommodate such students well.
  - AVP for Finance Elmer stated medical school is subsidized at the University of Arizona, and they have gone to the Board of Regents with the proposal to double the size of the medical school and it will cost \$43 million.
  - AVP for Finance Elmer this program is money in hand, where 100 students can be graduated per cohort for \$7.5 million a year which is significantly less. The reason for this is that the clinical training costs much less money than basic science didactic training, and the facilities required to educate those students in such an environment. This is the most fiscally efficient way to graduate residents into the State of Arizona.
- Senator Zeiders stated she shared the same concerns as Senator Schwartz, and it is difficult to be in a position with little transparency and oversight of initiatives given the current budget. Senator Zeiders asked if students airfare and housing are included in the tuition.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the program has applied for grants to cover airfare, housing, and other expenditures or activities of daily living. There is a goal to have money to support those things.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated under the leadership of Daniel Ferguson run the Arizona Health Education Program (AHEC), and there has been approval for a Native American AHEC program. Through the AHEC program, there are funds available for students in the State of Arizona for housing if not provided by the nations or other facilities available. There needs to be work done with Western Australia and how they will accommodate the lodging needs of the students. There will be travel expenses.
  - Senator Zeiders asked if the number of students that would have covered tuition and airfare is available at this time or if it is still up in the air.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated as students complete their rotations in the state of Arizona, the answer is zero. The scholarship ability is 14% where full scholarships can be offered to twenty-eight students at any given time within the state.
- Chair Hudson asked if students are going to receive one or two degrees.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the students will be receiving two degrees.
- Chair Hudson stated she understands that one degree is a fully accredited Australian medical degree that will function as a foreign medical degree, and the second is the MD Global that does not grant the privileges or licensure of an MD without a parenthetical global.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the second will be a University of Arizona MD with the caveat that will not be accredited by the LCME.
  - Chair Hudson asked who the accreditor is.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the accreditor is the Australian Medical Council.

- Chair Hudson asked for clarification on the accreditor for the Arizona portion of the degree.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the Arizona part of the degree will be accredited by WSCUC.
- Chair Hudson stated at this time, last year, everyone was introduced to WSCUC in the rapid integration of UAGC which took place over winter break leading to a two-month exploration of the relationship of WSCUC. Chair Hudson stated she would like to submit and have attached to the minutes, all the correspondence between herself, WSCUC, the President of the University, and the U.S. Department of Education (See appendix, pg. 10). Chair Hudson stated her concerns regarding WSCUC's relationship to the UAGC deal remained unanswered and unalleviated.
- Chair Hudson asked Mr. Elmer what the current payroll is for the program and under the College of Health Sciences, what is its percentage. Chair Hudson asked if there are faculty on the payroll.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated there are currently faculty on the payroll, which is about 5.8 FTE, also including administrative staff. There is a hiring plan that can be shared which shows hiring for Indigenous Affairs, accreditation, curricular affairs, etcetera. This includes leadership roles in developing the program itself. The current payroll for the current fiscal year is about \$2.4 million and it is expected to rise in fiscal year 2025 to slightly over \$2.8 million.
  - Chair Hudson asked how many administrators are included in the figure.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated there are no administrators but there are about twenty administrative support staff which include program coordinators, strategy directors, etcetera.
  - Chair Hudson asked how much of the total budget of the College of Health Sciences does the Global MD department comprise.
  - AVP for Finance, Elmer stated currently, the money is coming out of College of Health Sciences administration and the total unrestricted dollars available is around \$20 million.
- Senator Fink stated he would like to echo Senator Downing's comment and asked what provisions are in place that students who go abroad to Australia will return and not change their mind to obtain a full Australian degree. Senator Fink asked if there is just a "hope" that this will not happen.
  - AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated the students will not be admitted to the University of Western Australian School of Medicine, so if they elect not to return, they will have only completed two years of medical school without completing a degree. While students are in Australia, they will be coached to pass the USMLE exam which is required to practice in the United States. It is suspected that students would like to continue their career. AVP for UAHS New Initiatives, Dr. Goldschmid stated Senator Fink is correct, there might be someone who decides they don't want to continue, and they stay in Australia, but they won't be able to attend the same medical school.
- Secretary Dysart stated it is important to remember that WSCUC also accredits Stanford, and she feels very confident with their standards.
  - Secretary Dysart stated as she believes she is the only Native senator. This conversation seems very paternalistic at times with non-Natives telling Native doctors and Tribes how they should run medical education. Secretary Dysart stated she is excited that there will be a program that incorporates Native doctors into developing the curriculum that's unique and is what many Native students want. The College of Law is so popular because there is such a large population of Native professors. Secretary Dysart stated she was texted by other Native faculty who are listening to the meeting and are offended by comments made. Secretary Dysart stated she would like the record to reflect that these comments are offensive to Native faculty and students.
- Vice Chair Hymel stated the secret ballot will be distributed by OpaVote via email for **[Motion 2023/24-27]** to move forward with the Global MD Proposal.
  - Senator Fink raised a point of order and asked for a time limit on the OpaVote.
  - Vice Chair Hymel and Parliamentarian Stegeman stated ten minutes.

**[Motion 2023/24-27]** passed with thirty-one in favor, sixteen opposed, and two abstentions.

**B. HAS Resolution – Chair of the Faculty, Leila Hudson [01:02:42]**

Chair Hudson moved **[Motion 2023/24-28]** that the Senate endorses the resolution written to the Senate on November 14, 2023, by the Department of Hydrology and Atmospheric Sciences requesting an external audit of the University finances. Motion was seconded.

- Vice Chair Hymel stated a "yes" vote means you endorse the requests for an outside audit, and a "nay" vote means you do not support their proposal.
- Secretary Dysart requested a secret ballot.
- Senator Simmons asked if someone in the meeting could clarify if there is a comprehensive financial audit done every year anyways. Senator Simmons stated it is his understanding that these already occur and wants to clarify what is being asked for and how it compares to the financial reports.
  - Chair Hudson stated this would be a largely symbolic vote, supportive of the unanimous resolution in the College of Hydrology and Atmospheric Sciences which does not specify the type of audit. This would be an audit in addition to the internal audit process and the Annual Comprehensive Financial Review by the State's Auditor General. There are no details on how the additional audit would be paid for.

- Senator Simmons stated he is not necessarily opposed to the resolution and asked if the additional audit is being done due to no faith in the state audit.
  - Vice Chair Hymel stated the vote is merely an endorsement of the HAS Resolution.
  - Parliamentarian Stegeman stated there are many types of audits which focus on different issues therefore this is not asking for something redundant, but on the other hand, it is not clear what is being asked.
  - Chair Hudson stated this is a symbolic vote and the Senate does not have power over the senior leadership team. It is in support of a unanimous department which has been very central to the University over the past tragic year. It is not an expression of lack of faith in the existing audit processes, but the external audit that is done on an annual basis does not address certain aspects of the internal circulation of money.
  - Chair Hudson stated if she were asked to help design a contract with another audit vote after the vote, it would be to trace the flows of money within the institution such as internal loans to athletics. Currently, there is no process that does this systematically.
- Parliamentarian Stegeman stated if this motion is passed, it becomes incumbent on the Senate to decide what kind of audit it wants and there should be clarification at some point. A licensed auditor or accountant with familiarity with the process should be in the room for such discussion.
- Senator Downing stated an audit looks backwards and if there was a transparent system, there would be no need to ask for another audit. Senator Downing stated he is in favor of the motion and the real interest is to look forward, and to make certain that money transfers to who/when are known. There is a lot of money, staff, and faculty time being wasted. Senator Downing stated that this should be voted forward and for transparency to be shown.
- Senator Fink stated he is also in favor of the motion and asked if CALES Chief of Staff, Bethany Rutledge can be promoted to speak. Senator Fink stated to Parliamentarian Stegeman's point, there are different types of audits and within statewide audits, there is typically a script which includes what is being looked for. With an independent organization outside of the state, there may be more room for crafting and asking certain questions that internal audits would not cover. This may open an extra venue to ask certain questions not normally covered in audits.
- Vice Chair Hymel stated before any accounting firm can perform a financial audit, there must be an internal audit of things such as cash flows and bigger assets on the books of the institution. The University's internal audit is separate.
- Senator Fink stated CALES Chief of Staff, Bethany Rutledge has been promoted so he can now respond to questions.
- Vice Chair Hymel stated **[Motion 2023/24-28]** will be voted on via secret ballot with a ten-minute allotment.
  - **[Motion 2023/24-28]** passed with thirty in favor, fourteen opposed, and three abstentions.

### C. Special Announcement [01:14:12]

Chair Hudson stated her congratulations to Senator Downing on the birth of his first grandchild named Logos -- a word that has crossed the University's path very recently and promises a future of reason and continuing glory to the Downing family.

- Vice Chair Hymel stated the meeting will be adjourned once the vote for **[Motion 2023/24-28]** is in.
- Senator Downing stated his first grandchild's is named after the happenings at the institution.
- Vice Chair Hymel stated she would like to thank everyone from the Global MD program and the attendees for coming to the Senate meeting, and she wishes everyone has a wonderful break.
- Chair Hudson stated she would like to wish everyone a happy Winter holiday season, and she will try to refrain from calling anymore special meetings until late January at the earliest.

### Adjournment

With no further business, the meeting adjourned at 4:27 PM.

**Tessa Dysart, Secretary of the Faculty**  
**Jasmin Espino, Recording Secretary**

### Motions of September 26, 2023 Faculty Senate Meeting

**[Motion 2023/24-21]** to approve the agenda. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/24-22]** to approve seconded motion from the Graduate Council, Proposal MS Computer Science and Engineering. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/24-23]** to approve seconded motion from Graduate Council, Proposal Ph.D. Computer Science and



Engineering. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/24-24]** to approve seconded motion from Undergraduate Council, Proposal BS in Real Estate. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/24-25]** to approve seconded motion from Graduate Council, Enrollment Policies and Benchmarking. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/25-26]** to approve seconded motion from Graduate Council, Proposal Emancipatory Education Graduate Minor. Motion was seconded. Motion passed by unanimous consent.

**[Motion 2023/24-27]** to move forward with the Global MD Proposal. Motion was seconded. Motion passed with thirty-one in favor, sixteen opposed, and two abstentions.

**[Motion 2023-24/28]** moved that the Senate endorses the [resolution written to the Senate on November 14, 2023, by the Department of Hydrology and Atmospheric Sciences](#) requesting an external audit of the University finances. Motion was seconded. passed with thirty in favor, fourteen opposed, and three abstentions.

### **Attachments Within the Minutes**

1. Page 1, Item 2: Action Item Approval of the [Agenda](#)
2. Page 1, Item 3: Consent Agenda
  - [Proposal MS Computer Science and Engineering with ABOR Summary.](#)
  - [Proposal Ph.D. Computer Science and Engineering with ABOR Summary.](#)
  - [Proposal BS in Real Estate with ABOR Summary.](#)
  - [Enrollment Policies and Benchmarking.](#)
  - [Proposal Emancipatory Education Graduate Minor](#)
3. Page 1, New Business Item 4A: Information and Action Item: [Global MD Proposal](#) with [Presentation](#)
4. Page 7, New Business Item 4A: Information and Action Item: Chair Hudson's Documentation Regarding WSCUC Communications
  - [WASC letter](#)
  - [WSCUC Letter 1.13.23](#)
  - [NACIQI February 22 2023](#)
  - [Chair of the Faculty Statement to NACIQI 3 1 23](#)
  - [Robbins to Cardona Letter](#)
5. Page 7, New Business Item 4B: [HAS Resolution](#)

FACULTY CENTER  
1216 E. Mabel  
PO Box 210456