

Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure

FACULTY CENTER

1216 E. Mabel Street Tucson, AZ 85721-0456

Tel: 520.621.1342 Fax: 520.621.8844

facultycenter@email.arizona.edu

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure Annual Report 2022-2023

Committee Members

Dr. Dalila Ayoun, Chair	French and Italian	COH
Dr. Dian Li, Vice Chair	East Asian Studies	COH
Dr. Jennifer Earl	Sociology	SBS
Dr. Jamie Edgin	Psychology	COS
Dr. Samira Farwaneh	Middle Eastern/No. African Studies	SBS
Dr. Roberto Guzman	Chem/Enviro Engineering	ENGR
Dr. Jamie Lee	School of Information	SBS
Dr. Keith Maggert	Cellular/Molecular Medicine	COM
Dr. Alejandro Salado	Systems/Biosystems Engineering	ENGR
Dr. Gayatri Vedantam	Animal & Biomedical Sciences	CALS
Dr. Ramin Yadegari	School of Plant Sciences	CALS
Ms. Angie Zielenski	School of Art	COFA

Mission Statement

The Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure shall have jurisdiction to make inquiry and to conduct hearings in two general areas contained in ABOR 6-201 and 6-301, namely: in regard to those matters contained in the Conditions of Service dealing with the contractual employment relationship between the General Faculty member and the University /Board of Regents; and in regard to any internal matters relating to grievances against or by any member of the General Faculty. The committee shall consider the protection of academic freedom and tenure as a principal obligation. (Certain preliminary steps for dismissal situations are described in Chapters 3 and 4 of the *University Handbook for Appointed Personnel* and Sections 6-201 and 6-301 of the *University Handbook for Appointed Personnel* and Sections 6-201 of the *Arizona Board of Regents Policy Manual*.)



Hearings

CAFT held a hearing on December 7-8, 2021 via Zoom. The panel made its recommendation to President Robbins on January 17, 2022 after requesting an extension pursuant to Article VII, Section 6(a)(viii)(12). At the time of the last report, President Robbins had not yet rendered his decision. He has done so since then: CAFT's recommendation against the grievant was followed by President Robbins.

CAFT held a hearing on January 12-13, 2022 via Zoom. The hearing that was originally scheduled on December 13-14, 2021, was rescheduled at the request of the grievant. The panel made its recommendation to President Robbins on February 8, 2022. At the time of the last report, President Robbins had not yet rendered his decision. He has done so since then: CAFT's recommendation in favor of the grievant was not followed by President Robbins.

No other cases came before CAFT in 2022-2023.

The Chair is grateful for the expertise and dedication of CAFT members, all of whom volunteer their time for service on this important faculty rights committee.

Respectfully submitted,

Dalila Ayom

Dalila Ayoun Chair, CAFT (2019-2023)





1216 East Mabel Street PO Box 210456

Tucson, AZ 85721

Ofc: 520-621-1342 Fax: 520-621-8844

facultygovernance.arizona.edu

Committee on Conciliation ANNUAL REPORT 2022-23

Committee Members	Department	College	Term
Dr. Cynthia White, Chair	Classics	COH	2021-2023
Dr. M. Grandner, Vice-Chair	Psychiatry	COM-T	2021-2023
Dr. Albrecht Classen	German Studies	COH	2022-2024
Dr. Duarte Diaz	Animal/Biomed Sci	CALS	2022-2024
Dr. Shufang Su	Physics	COS	2021-2023
Dr. Lynda Żwinger	English	SBS	2022-2024

There was no **Referral for Appeal** forwarded to the Committee on Conciliation.

Respectfully Submitted,

Professor Cynthia White, Chair Committee on Conciliation





1216 East Mabel Street PO Box 210456 Tucson, AZ 85721

Ofc: 520-621-1342 Fax: 520-621-8844

facultygovernance.arizona.edu

Constitution and Bylaws Committee

2022-2023 Annual Report

Members:

Prof. Tessa L. Dysart, **CHAIR,** Secretary of the Faculty Dr. Alex Braithwaite, SBS Dr. Amy Fountain, SBS Dr. Mark Stegeman, Eller Dr. Ted Downing, RII Dr. Andrea Romero, *ex-officio*/non-voting

Our committee held several meetings over the year. We primarily addressed the issue of inconsistent governing documents. We discovered that the Constitution and Bylaws posted on the faculty governance website were different from the documents shared with faculty during elections and forwarded to the president's office for approval. We spent the majority of the year working with the president's office to set forth a plan for finalizing our governing documents.

Because we did not have a final set of documents, we approved very few Constitution and Bylaws changes. Most recently we have worked on amendments to Art. II, Sec. 2 of the faculty constitution.

Respectfully submitted

Tessa L. Dysart Chair Constitution and Bylaws Committee



THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA FACULTY SENATE STANDING COMMITTEE ON DIVERSITY, EQUITY, AND INCLUSION

ANNUAL REPORT

During the AY 2022-2023, the Faculty Senate's Diversity Equity and Inclusion Committee (DEIC) gathered numerous pressing issues from the different constituencies, compiled reports, petitions, and resolutions that were presented and communicated to both the faculty senate and the Senior Leadership Team (SLT). This year we were so fortunate to work with a team of brilliant, meticulous, and passionate representatives committed to addressing pertinent DEI challenges and make our institution a better place.

The opening meetings in early September focused more on issues carried over from the previous year mostly these two:

- It was brought to the Committee's attention that DEI focuses more on the issues of race, gender, and religion than disability. Moving forward the committee, committed itself to bringing issues of disability to the front-burner when thinking about DEI on campus.
- Faculty and other constituencies were concerned about how issues related to Critical Race Theory (CRT) were unfolding in Florida and Texas and tasked a sub-committee to draft a statement in support of CRT and other DEI related issues and practices. Attempt to ban these should be treated as a violation of academic freedom and freedom of speech.

The September 30th incident involving police, black students and the then Associate Vice Provost for Diversity and Inclusion brought to light several unresolved DEI issues and the Committee took the lead in opening dialogue with the SLT and proffering solutions and suggestions on how to overcome these DEI challenges. DEIC promptly issued a statement addressed to the SLT specifically advising them to among other things, fix the broken DEI structures and also to act promptly to re-organize the ODI and the Cultural Centers with input from all relevant constituencies and stakeholders. The committee issued a shorter preview statement that was followed by a much longer and detailed statement (see attached statements)

The start of the spring semester the State of Arizona proposed SB1694 which passed the senate and the house in March and April respectively. Currently awaiting to be signed into law, this bill prohibits a public entity from requiring and spending public monies on a diversity, equity, and inclusion program:

- Once again DEIC resumed drafting the anti-woke and anti-CRT statement we had been working on since last fall.
- Another faculty senator with interest in the topic and the subject helped the DEIC subcommittee adopt and modify the Anti CRT draft to directly address the dangers posed by SB 1694 to Academic Freedom and Free Speech as enshrined in *The Universal Declaration of Human Rights*'s article 19.
- Once again, the sub-committee drafted two statements comprising a shorter version written in language accessible to a generalist audience and the second version specifically

addressing the language used in the bill. The Chair of the Faculty Senate read the combined statements and senators voted to approve and adopt it.

Following the appointment of the Interim Vice President and Chief Inclusion Officer last fall, four DEIC Members were invited to be part of a DEI task force that was created to assist the new appointee to craft the description for the job posting for a substantive hire and also to draft an institutional roadmap for DEI. This all important task will likely continue through summer into the next academic year.

Plans for the Next Academic Year

- To work collaboratively with the SLT to take immediate practical action to remove the structural barriers that create and perpetuate DEI problems.
- **DEIC must continue its role of providing checks and balances to ensure that** the institution is attentive, responsive, and accountable especially to issues affecting marginalized constituencies.
- serves the students and its needs to listen, honor and respond to the narratives of what these students are experiencing in a timely manner.
- To participate and engage all relevant stakeholders in the search for the new Chief Inclusion Officer.
- To continue to engage the SLT in constructive dialogue and hold them accountable for their stated goals and commitment to DEI in order to ensure excellence.
- To follow up and evaluate the implementation of recommendations made in fall and spring.



University Committee on Ethics and Commitment

FACULTY CENTER

1216 East Mabel Street PO Box 210456

Tucson, AZ 85721 Ofc: 520-621-1342 Fax: 520-621-8844

facultygovernance.arizona. edu

UNIVERSITY COMMITTEE ON ETHICS AND COMMITMENT 2022-2023 Annual Report

UCEC Members:

Dr. Kurt Gustin, Chair (6/20-5/23) (COM-PHX) Mr. Stephen Hussman, Vice Chair (6/20-5/23) (LIB) Dr. Damian Baca (6/21-5/24) (SBS) Dr. Kate Bunton (6/21-5/24) (COS) Dr. Fabio Lanza (6/22-5/25) (COH) **Ex officio:** Mr. Scott Pryor **Research Integrity Officer (RIO)**

Mission (from Faculty Constitution, Article V, Section 7)

"The University Committee on Ethics and Commitment shall deal with questions of misconduct inresearch, scholarship, or creative endeavor; conflict of commitment; and facilities misuse; and receive reports from the Research Integrity Officer. In its deliberations it will use the current versions of the University policies on research integrity, professional commitment and proper facilities use."

See also the inquiry function of the UCEC as described in UHAP 2.13.09: "Policy and Procedures for Investigations of Misconduct in Scholarly, Creative and Research Activities."

The Committee's Annual Meeting was held on August 25, 2022. During the meeting Dr. Gustin was elected Chair and Mr. Hussman Vice Chair for 2022-2023. The committee members reviewed the annual report and the charge of the Committee on Ethics.

During the 2022-2023 academic year, the committee investigated one allegation of research misconduct. The request to form the inquiry panel was received from the Research Integrity Officer on November 30, 2022. An Inquiry panel consisting of 3 UCEC members was formed and investigated the allegations by reviewing evidence provided by the claimant and respondent and conducting interviews with key



individuals. The Inquiry Panel submitted a final report with Findings and Recommendations to the Research Integrity Officer on March 22, 2023.

Respectfully submitted,

Kurt Gustin Associate Professor Department of Basic Medical Sciences The University of Arizona College of Medicine-Phoenix ABC1 Building, Rm 328 425 N. Fifth Street, Phoenix, AZ 85004-2157 Phone: 602-827-2155 Fax: 602-827-2127 kgustin@arizona.edu





1216 East Mabel Street PO Box 210456 Tucson, AZ 85721

Ofc: 520-621-1342 Fax: 520-621-8844

facultygovernance.arizona.edu

Committee on Faculty Membership

2022-2023 Annual Report

Members:

Prof. Tessa L. Dysart, **CHAIR**, Secretary of the Faculty Dr. Dana Narter, SBS (dismissed by Chair in October 2022) Dr. Dan McDonald, CALS (dismissed by Chair in October 2022) Dr. Andrea Romero, *ex officio*/non-voting Dr. Judd Ruggill, COH (dismissed by Chair in October 2022 but reinstated following discussions)

Our committee met in July to consider a request from research faculty at RII to receive representation in the Senate. We determined that under the plain language of our Bylaws, Article VIII, Sec. 2. This decision was conveyed to the Senate at the September meeting.

After the RII Senate seat was discussed in Senate and the Secretary clarified that the Committee on Faculty Membership is responsible for apportionment of the Senate per the faculty constitution, the Chair of the Faculty dismissed three members of the Committee—Drs. Narter, McDonald, and Ruggill. The dismissed members sent a letter to the Chair explaining that under the Constitution and Bylaws they should retain their seats because they were in the middle of their terms. Dr. Ruggill's term ends in 2023, and Drs. Narter and McDonald had de facto started new terms at the start of the 2022 academic year. The Chair reappointed Dr. Ruggill, but did not reappoint the other committee members or replace them on the Committee. Thus, the Committee lacked a quorum to act this for the majority of the academic year.

Respectfully submitted

Tessa L. Dysart, Chair Committee on Faculty Membership





1216 E. Mabel Street Tucson, AZ 85721-0456

Tel: 520.621.1342 Fax: 520.621.8844 facultycenter@email.arizona.edu

Grievance Clearinghouse Committee 2022-2023 Annual Report

Committee Members

Dalila Ayoun, COH Dian Li, COH Sharon Dial, VET MED Kurt Gustin, COM-P Kristen Klotz Cynthia White, COH Chair, CAFT Vice-Chair, CAFT (Non-voting) Senate Representative Chair, Ethics Director, Office of Institutional Equity Chair, Conciliation

Mission

The Grievance Clearinghouse Committee shall be the faculty committee that accepts faculty members' written requests for grievance hearings and which determines which committee (Conciliation, Committee on Academic Freedom and Tenure, University Committee on Ethics and Commitment) or process (Office of Institutional Equity) should consider a grievance.

Petitions

The Committee reviewed two petitions in the 2022-2023 academic year:

- A complaint from a faculty member was received on February 17, 2023 regarding professional duties. The Committee declined to refer the case to any of the committees because it fell outside of their purview.
- A complaint from a post-doctoral researcher was received on February 13 alleging inappropriate professional conduct from a supervisor. The Committee was unable to refer the case to any of the committees under its purview because, according to the UA Faculty Constitution, the GCC can only consider grievances from members of the General Faculty, a category that does not include postdoctoral researchers.

The GCC notes that a grievant appealed its decision rendered in November 10, 2021. The Chair of the Faculty appointed a panel to review it. It was upheld.



The Chair is grateful for the work and expertise of GCC members, all of whom volunteer their time to serve on this important shared governance committee.

Respectfully submitted,

/m V

Dalila Ayoun, Chair Grievance Clearinghouse Committee





1216 E. Mabel Street Tucson, AZ 85721-0456

Tel: 520.621.1342 Fax: 520.621.8844

facultycenter@email.arizona.edu

THE UNIVERSITY OF ARIZONA_® **Faculty Senate Standing Committee** Faculty Center 1216 E. Mabel St. - PO Box 210456 621-1342 (Fax: 621-8844) **Research Policy Committee**

ANNUAL REPORT 2022-23

Committee Members:

Dr. David Cuillier, **CHAIR**, SBS (6/20-5/23) Ms. Addison Coen, GPSC (6/22-5/23) Dr. Wolfgang Fink, ENGR (6/20-5/23) Dr. Paul Gordon, COM-T (6/19-5/23) Dr. Kristin Morrill, Postdoc (6/22-5/23) Dr. Stanley Pau, OSC (6/11-5/23) Dr. Marlys Witte, COM-T (6/13-5/23) Ms. Megan Wong, ASUA (6/22-5/23) Dr. Lucy Ziurys, COS (12/22-5/23)

The Research Policy Committee completed its work this year on several issues of importance to UA researchers:

1. Facilities & Administration distributions to principal investigators

Last year, the RPC <u>studied allocation of F&A</u>, and in April 2022, <u>recommended</u> the Faculty Senate meet Fall 2022 to recommend a mandated campus-wide direct distribution to PIs, to incentivize research. In July 2022, AIB was launched with the provision that PIs should receive 2% from their grants' IDC. The Provost emailed the RPC on Aug. 10 to ask for input on some of the details (see Aug. 24, 2022, <u>memo</u> with background information).

In Fall 2022, the RPC collected feedback from Faculty Senators and college budget officers using an anonymous online form. A summary, with results and responses to open-ended questions, is provided <u>here</u>. The committee then solicited data and insights from the 20 college budget officers on how they distributed funds before AIB, and how they plan to do so in the future. These data are summarized in this <u>spreadsheet</u>.

The RPC provided its final <u>recommendations</u> to the Faculty Senate at its Dec. 5 meeting regarding direct distributions to researchers from funds generated from their facilities and administration portion of their grants. The Faculty Senate voted in strong



support of the recommendations (no senator voting "no"). The RPC then met with Provost Liesl Folks on March 27, 2023, to discuss the recommendations, reaching agreement on some, but not on others (see <u>RPC update report</u> to Faculty Senate, April 3, 2023). The RPC recommended to the Faculty Senate that it continue to urge a higher distribution to PIs, from 2% to 5%.

2. Conflict of interest policy changes affecting researchers

The RPC looked into how changes to the conflict of interest policies affect researchers. The committee met Jan. 30, 2023, with Taren Ellis Langford, senior director of Research, Innovation & Impact's Office for Responsible Outside Interests, and Sangita Judge, vice president of operations for Research, Innovation & Impact, to gather information about the new policies. The committee then met Feb. 27, 2023, with Dr. Betsy Cantwell, senior vice president for research and innovation. The committee will continue to monitor the issue, as well as the impact of the new AIB budgeting model on research.

3. Other issues

Several other issues to be examined in the upcoming year include changes in the "Research Scholar" title, and following up on researchers' perceptions toward the campus core research facilities.

4. Committee changes for the upcoming year

Chair David Cuillier accepted a job at the University of Florida, departing the UA on May 21, 2023. Dr. Lucy Ziurys agreed to serve as chair of the RPC, if appointed.

Here is a summary of the RPC's meetings for the year:

August 29, 2022

The first meeting of the FY2022-23, the group discussed setting an agenda for the year with a goal to mainly discuss indirect cost.

September 26, 2022

The committee started hammering out its recommendations on F&A distributions to PIs.

October 31, 2022

The committee continued its work on the F&A PI distribution, inviting college budget officers to discuss (none showed up to the meeting). The committee finalized six recommendations to provide to the Faculty Senate.

November 28, 2022

The committee discussed ongoing issues, including the F&A PI distribution (awaiting presentation at Faculty Senate's Dec. 5 meeting), conflict of interest policies, and researcher views of campus core research facilities.

January 30, 2023

The committee met with Taren Ellis Langford, senior director of Research, Innovation & Impact's Office for Responsible Outside Interests, and Sangita Judge, vice president of operations for Research, Innovation & Impact, to gather information about the new policies regarding conflicts of interest.



February 27, 2023

The committee met with Dr. Betsy Cantwell, senior vice president for research and innovation to discuss the effect of the new AIB budgeting model on research, as well as the conflict of interest policies affecting researchers.

March 27, 2023

The RPC met with Provost Liesl Folks to work through the F&A PI distribution recommendations, reaching agreement on some but not others. The committee will finish its discussions of this topic and others at its final meeting of the year, April 24, 2023.

Respectfully submitted,

Dr. David Cuillier Chair, RPC

